Game Evaluation Rubric/Measurement Tool

Game Name: Mine Craft – Obstacle Course

Subject: ELL – Following Directions   **Estimated Lesson Time:** 30 minutes
Grade: 4 & up   **Cost:** Lesson is Free/Minecraft $26.95 US   **Hardware:** Monitor/Keyboard/Mouse OR Touch Screen
Operating System: OSX/Windows XP/iOS/Android   **Computer Base:** Yes   **Online:** Yes

DESCRIPTION OF GAME:
This map is an obstacle course for students to complete. It uses archery, a maze, platform jumping, red stone pistons, boat navigation, ladder jumping, and arrow dodging. Some learning opportunities for students in this lesson are to increase critical thinking skills, increase perseverance, and the ability to follow directions.

Category	Needs Improvement =1pt	Satisfactory = 2pts	Very Good = 3pts	Exceptional = 4pts	Total
Graphics and User Interface Design	Images do not connect to text or they are irrelevant. The interface is hard to comprehend, use, and it is inappropriate for the target audience. Screens are either cluttered or empty causing an imbalance between graphics. Nonexistent attention paid to graphics. Game design does not look good and game play is mired by the visuals.	Images are not always relevant. Text is not always present or doesn't connect to images. The interface is a bit challenging to comprehend, use, and it is difficult for the target audience to master. Screens are either cluttered or empty. Inconsistent attention paid to sizing, placement, and type of graphics and text used. The game looks OK but game play experience is not enhanced by the visuals.	Images and text are mostly relevant. The interface is fairly easy to comprehend, use, and target audiences should be able to master. Most screens contain well-placed graphics, with a balance of text and images with few inconsistencies. The game looks good and the play experience is weakly enhanced by the visuals.	Images and text are all relevant. The interface is easy to comprehend, use, and is well designed for the target audience. Objects on all pages are well thought out. Screens are not cluttered or empty. The game looks great and game play experience is strongly enhanced by the visuals.	4
Functionality and Navigation	Necessary buttons or tools are missing or difficult to utilize. Navigating the game is puzzling and information cannot be found simply. Navigation from screen to screen is difficult or impossible. The game did not function properly.	Not all necessary buttons or tools are present. Navigation from screen to screen is difficult or confusing. Some navigation is uncertain, causing the user to become lost in a few places and the student requires help to navigate. An incomplete set of game components work, with minor functionality problems.	All buttons or tools are present but some are hard to use. Navigation from screen to screen is typically easy. Navigation is mostly understandable and users can navigate with little assistance. Most components of the game work properly and support game play.	All buttons or tools are present making it easy to utilize. Navigation from screen to screen is consistently flawless. The game is well organized and easy to navigate. Users can clearly understand where they are and where to go next and can navigate with no assistance. All components of the game work properly and support game play.	2
Feedback for the User	No opportunities are presented to receive feedback on user performance.	There are few opportunities presented to receive feedback on user performance.	There are opportunities presented to receive feedback on user performance but they are not timely or consistent.	There are frequent opportunities for users to receive consistent and timely feedback on their performance.	1
Educational Value of Subject and Content	Information is brief or incorrect. Little comprehension of content is evident from presentation. The subject of the game is incomplete and the game misinforms the target audience or contains no educational content.	Some solid information presented; however, some information is brief and incorrect. The subject of the game is vaguely described and the game is not practical as a learning experience for the target audience.	Information is clear and correct throughout the majority of the presentation. The subject of the game is partially described and the game is useful as a learning experience for the target audience but learning content contains minor errors.	Information is well presented, clear, flawless, and correct throughout. The subject of the game is clearly stated and the game is a valuable resource as a learning experience for the user.	1

Goals and Objectives	Goals are incomplete and there is no way to measure what the users must know to complete the game. Learning objectives are non-existent.	Goals are vague and it is unclear how to measure what the users must know to complete the game. Learning objectives are unclear.	Goals are partially described and partially measure what users must know in order to complete the game. Some learning objectives are identified but not all.	Goals are clearly stated and measure what users must know to be able to do to accomplish the game. Learning objectives are clearly identified.	2
Higher Order Thinking Skills • Synthesis • Evaluation • Analysis	The game provides no activities to help users increase their higher order thinking skills.	The game provides limited activities to help users increase their higher order thinking skills.	The game provides some activities to help users increase their higher order thinking skills.	The game provides multiple activities to help users increase their higher order thinking skills.	2
Motivation and Transfer to Real World Situations	The game's motivational components are vague and unconvincing. Game has no obvious applications to transfer to the real world.	There is significant uncertainty about the value or rationale behind the motivational components in the game. Game has obvious applications for the real world but users are unable to transfer knowledge to perform any tasks that are similar outside the game.	There is a little to no uncertainty about the value or rationale behind the game. Game components make connections to real life, but students are unable to perform some of the tasks that are similar without the game.	The game successfully motivates its intended audience. Knowledge and skills learned in the game can be easily connected with and transferred to real life situations.	1

Total: 13/28

Rating Scale

22 - 28 points	**EXEMPLARY:** this game is appropriate and can be seen as useful in an educational setting.
21 – 15 points	**GOOD:** this is not the first choice game, but if budget cuts and other constraints make it impossible to purchase a game in the exemplary category, these games are second best.
14 - 8 points	**SATISFACTORY:** this category of game is not necessarily suitable for use in an educational setting. This game is only satisfactory which means that it satisfies some criteria but lacks in the majority of the criteria needed.
0 – 7 points	**NEEDS IMPROVEMENT:** this game should not be used at all. The game is not fully functioning and is not ready to be played. The game must be improved before being used in the classroom.

Notes
→ Students need background information prior to executing this lesson (shoot bow and arrow, climb waterfall, drive a boat, sprint)
→ If students run out of items (arrows) there is no way to acquire more, therefore leaving with no way to advance beyond the first challenge.
→ A stretch to find a prescribed learning outcome that fits this lesson – more of a fun challenge reward for students.

Video Link: http://youtu.be/0Iv4Dj4wI5k

FURTHER THOUGHTS FROM THE SCREEN CAST

I chose to observe and critique a lesson called, "Obstacle Course" for Minecraft. When I first attempted this lesson I became increasingly frustrated by the lack of instruction and information boxes. There were no signs telling me where to start or what I was to do. If the instructor hasn't mastered this lesson, there will be no one able to provide guidance to beginner Minecraft users.

I also found it to be a struggle to find a reasonable learning outcome to attach to this lesson. In the end I decided this would best fit a reward challenge at the end of another productive Minecraft lesson. And for that productive lesson I had the thought to create a world for my students where they would follow explicit instruction from me on how to build certain tools and other objects, progressively building larger and larger objects. After several successful attempts following my directions I would allow them to create their own items with accompanying instructions. They would then pass these instructions on to a classmate to see if they could successfully build the item following the instructions they created. This could then ladder into a team-building lesson where they work together in pairs, or small groups to create even larger items by following other's instructions.

My overall opinion of this lesson was that it was lacking an educational connection to any learning outcomes; could potentially be very frustrating for students that are unfamiliar with Minecraft and it needs instruction and guiding signs throughout the obstacle course. I didn't see an opportunity for team building in this lesson, as it was simply a challenge and race against each other. This type of challenge environment can lead to students becoming stressed that everyone is ahead of them and they will shut down and not continue to try the task. This would be incredibly unsuccessful and a wasted opportunity for a student to engage in a new way of learning.

However, while muddling my way through this lesson it made me realize how I want to utilize Minecraft to teach my students to follow directions and give clear directions to others. Sometimes experiencing what you don't like gives you the insight to create what you do like!